

MICHIGAN NATURAL RESOURCES TRUST FUND

BOARD OF TRUSTEES MEETING

Minutes of December 5, 2005 Evening Session – 6:00-8:00 PM

Minutes of December 6, 2006 Regular Meeting – 9:00 AM

Best Western Midway Hotel

7711 West Saginaw Highway, Lansing

**Monday, December 5, 2005 – Evening Session**

The evening meeting of the Michigan Natural Resources Trust Fund (MNRTF) Board of Trustees commenced at 6:11 PM.

The following Board members were present:

Bob Garner  
Steven Hamp  
Lana Pollack  
Sam Washington

Due to a prior commitment, Mr. Torre was not in attendance.

Also in attendance were various staff members of the Department of Natural Resources (DNR) and other interested parties.

The purpose of the evening meeting was for an open discussion of projects being brought before the Board for possible funding. Because of the Open Meetings Act, the Board cannot meet in a caucus to discuss projects. No decisions will be made nor actions taken at this meeting.

All presentations were limited to five (5) minutes per project.

The following made presentations:

Mike Powers – 05-109, Manistique Central Park Improvements, City of Manistique  
Nicole Sanderson – 05-021, Gladstone 10<sup>th</sup> Street Park, City of Gladstone  
Roger Sabine – 05-055, Coldwater/Thornapple River Acquisition, Kent County  
Tobi Lake – 05-169, Diamond Lake Campground and Recreation Area, Newaygo County  
Kevin Ricco – 05-001, New Richmond Bridge Park Development, Allegan County  
Mindy Milos-Dale – 05-102, Stony Creek Corridor Park Acquisition, Oakland Township and  
05-103, Marsh View Park Development, Oakland Township  
Scott Wyman – 05-098, Russ Forest Parking Area Project, Cass County  
Randy DeBruine – 05-052, Silk City Nature Trail, City of Belding  
John Griffith – 05-078, Gratiot River County Park Addition, Keweenaw County  
Jeri Feltner – 05-084, DeTour Waterfront Property Acquisition, Village of DeTour Village  
Tom Bailey – 05-141, Lee Grande Ranch Conservation Easement, DNR; and 05-142, Bear  
River Parcel Conservation Easement, DNR  
Suzie Fitzgibbon – 05-027, South Haven Area Recreation Area, City of South Haven  
Jon Noyes – 05-032, Highland Township Property Acquisition, Oakland County

Todd Zeller – 05-117, Falling Waters Trail Project, Jackson County  
Joe Duff – 05-035, Elkview Park Development, City of Gaylord  
Steven Black – 05-023, Bay City Riverwalk Extension, City of Bay City  
Brent Michalek – 05-101, Camp Pet-o-se-ga Campground Loop Facilities, Emmet County  
Dennis Keiser – 05-063, Walloon Lake Access, Bear Creek Township  
Jim Hendricks – 05-173, Ashmun Bay Park Acquisition, City of Sault Ste. Marie  
Todd Blake – 05-107, Fremont Town and Country Path, City of Fremont  
Steven Puchovan – 05-118, Ransom Lake Natural Area, Almira Township  
Andrew Mutch and Randy Auler – 05-165, Village Wood Lake/Orchard Hills West Acquisition,  
City of Novi  
John Bayles – 05-058, Grand Ledge Riverwalk, City of Grand Ledge  
Mark Brochu – 05-088, Bauman Road Farms Property Acquisition, St. Clair County  
Mr. Mike McDonald and Susan Nyquist – 05-162, Camp Yentema Acquisition, HCMA  
Natasha Lapinski – 05-147, Lighthouse West Property Conservation Easement, DNR  
Garret Johnson – 05-133, Kamehameha Schools Development Rights Purchase, DNR

The evening session adjourned at 8:32 PM.

### **Tuesday, December 6, 2005 – Regular Meeting**

The regular meeting of the MNRTF Board of Trustees commenced at 9:03 AM.

The following Board members were present:

Bob Garner  
Lana Pollack  
Frank Torre  
Sam Washington

Due to a prior commitment, Mr. Hamp was not in attendance.

Also in attendance were various staff members of the DNR and other interested parties.

#### **I. ADOPTION OF MINUTES FOR MEETING OF OCTOBER 19, 2005.**

Chairperson Washington called for the adoption of the October 19, 2005 Board meeting minutes.

**MOVED BY MR. GARNER, SUPPORTED BY MR. TORRE, TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE OCTOBER 19, 2005 MNRTF BOARD MEETING. PASSED.**

#### **II. ADOPTION OF AGENDA FOR MEETING OF DECEMBER 6, 2005.**

Chairperson Washington called for the adoption of the agenda for the December 6, 2005 Board meeting.

**MOVED BY MS. POLLACK, SUPPORTED BY MR. TORRE, TO APPROVE THE AGENDA FOR THE DECEMBER 6, 2005 MNRTF BOARD MEETING. PASSED.**

### III. PUBLIC APPEARANCES.

#### Mr. David Heyboer, Friends of the White Pine Trail – Adding Donor Name to White Pine Trail.

Mr. David Heyboer, representing the Friends of the White Pine Trail, made a presentation to add a donor name to the White Pine Trail. The Friends of the White Pine Trail was formed in 1997. The trail has been adopted by the “Friends” organization and provides all but major maintenance. The trail is currently 92 miles in length. To date, the “Friends” have raised \$180,000 towards the trail. The “Friends” provide approximately 2,000 hours per year in maintenance. It is important to the “Friends” that the trail stays open without charging fees.

The MNRTF has provided approximately \$485,000 towards the White Pine Trail. The “Friends” have a donor who wants, semi-anonymously, to donate \$1 million to help pave the rest of the White Pine Trail. This \$1 million will leverage approximately \$6 million, of which \$2.24 million is federal high priority enhancement funds that the “Friends” have worked to secure through Congressman Camp. The main stipulation for the \$1 million to come to the White Pine Trail is that the donor would like his name added to the trail. The rest of the money would be used for improvement of the trail and to use as leverage to raise additional match money. This would be part of the West Michigan Trails and Greenways Coalition Capital Campaign. They are getting geared up to start this spring to raise money to leverage federal and state dollars for the entire west Michigan area.

Chairperson Washington asked if the donor is asking to have the name “White Pine Trail” removed. Mr. Heyboer responded no, it would be the “White Pine ‘Donor’s Name’ Trail” or vice versa. The “Friends” are not asking for any additional funds from the MNRTF, only to have the donor’s name added to the White Pine Trail name. With the donor’s \$1 million contribution, it would enable the “Friends” to pave the trail to the City of Cadillac. There is much support for this change from Congressmen, state legislators and other entities.

Mr. Heyboer pointed out that in 2002 the Board approved a name change of a Greenville project in a similar situation.

Chairperson Washington asked if anyone has thought to ask the donor if he would be willing to buy out the state’s interest in the trail so it would no longer be a matter of public money.

Mr. Heyboer responded that he did not know if this was possible, and would have to confer with the donor. He does believe, however, that some people would like to see more clarity in who owns the trail. The “Friends” did not know that the MNRTF was involved with the trail until last week, when signage was put up.

#### Ms. Jan Proli, Friends of the White Pine Trail.

Ms. Jan Proli, member of the Friends of the White Pine Trail, advised the Board that the “Friends” had received a Transportation Enhancement grant to pave eight miles of the trail. The grant required a local match of \$126,000 and the “Friends” had already raised \$49,000. Mr. Heyboer and Ms. Proli met with the donor to ask for assistance on the project and started an ongoing relationship with his organization. The donor asked if \$1 million would pave the trail. The only stipulation for the donation would be to add the donor’s name to the trail.

Mr. Paul Winchester, Friends of the White Pine Trail.

Mr. Paul Winchester, member of the Friends of the White Pine Trail, advised the Board that they had several letters of support from elected officials in their packet of information. In addition, Congressman Dave Camp fought for the Transportation and Reauthorization Bill that will release the \$2.24 million to the White Pine Trail for paving. The stipulation for the \$2.24 million is that a match of 20 percent is provided, or \$448,000. One of the significant parts of the \$1 million donation is that it would enable the \$2.24 million to be released.

Mr. Winchester also pointed out that the legislators who sent letters of support (U.S. Senator Debbie Stabenow, Congressman Dave Camp, Senator Sikkema, Senator McManus, Senator Cropsey, Representative Pearce, Representative Emmons and Representative Booher) endorse multi-use recreation trails, and in particular, Michigan's longest recreational trail—the White Pine Trail.

Mr. Jack Richards, Vice-President, Friends of the White Pine Trail.

Mr. Jack Richards, Vice-President of the Friends of the White Pine Trail, summarized the "Friends" presentation by thanking the Board for hearing their request. He reiterated that the "Friends" is a voluntary group with no personal gain other than to make this trail a better recreational opportunity for the people in the State of Michigan. He feels that the White Pine Trail, as well as the other trails linking into it, presents a tremendous opportunity to become a destination for people all over the country to come and use for recreation.

Mr. Peter DeBoer, Executive Director, West Michigan Trails and Greenways Coalition.

Mr. Peter DeBoer, Executive Director of the West Michigan Trails and Greenways Coalition, advised the Board that it is the Coalition's goal to build 140 miles of new trailway in Michigan. This is a \$27 million project and the Coalition will need to raise approximately \$6 million in local funds to match the state and federal funding.

Mr. DeBoer further stated that naming is an important part of fund-raising. Across the state many important things have names of donors on them.

The White Pine Trail has no major metropolitan area in its northern part. This donation is specifically for the northern part of the trail from the donor so it would be a big boost for the project. The donor is not only interested in supporting this trail, but is interested in supporting other trails. He has, in fact, asked one of the vice-presidents of his company to serve on a steering committee.

Ms. Carolyn Kane, Secretary, Fred Meijer Heartland Trail.

Ms. Carolyn Kane, Secretary of the Fred Meijer Heartland Trail, outlined the Fred Meijer Heartland Trail for the Board. This trail received its name from Fred Meijer for his generous donations. This is a paved hiking-biking path. In 1994, the land was purchased through a gift from Fred and Lena Meijer and donated to the National Rails-to-Trails Conservancy, thereby preserving the Montcalm County Linear Park. This trail is approximately 41 miles long and covers an abandoned railroad right-of-way west from Alma and through Elwell, Riverdale, Vestaburg, Cedar Lake and Edmore. At Edmore the trail turns south running through McBride, Stanton, Sidney and ends at Greenville, where it connects to the Greenville Fred Meijer Flat River Trail.

Ms. Kane further stated that Mr. Meijer has been very generous with contributions to the Heartland Trail. In 1994, he donated \$265,000 to the trail. In addition, he provided \$160,000 for the first section of paving. In 1996, Mr. Meijer personally attended the public meeting at Sidney for the resolution of support, as there was a lot of opposition to the trail. At that meeting, Mr. Meijer stated that the trail would be a safe haven for families and away from traffic.

In 2000, ownership was passed on to the Fred Meijer Heartland Trail. Mr. Meijer provided another donation of \$70,000. As of 2000, Mr. Meijer has matched over \$222,000. In addition, he provided funding for a parking lot in McBride for the community and trail. He contributed \$200,000 for a 5-1/2-mile acquisition which will be a connection from the trail to Greenville and the Fred Meijer Flat River Trail, and connecting up to the City of Alma. He also provided another \$1 million for match for the Transportation Equity Legacy for Users federal grant received.

Ms. Kane concluded by stating that building trails for the future makes a difference, and we have been very fortunate to have had the financial support of Mr. Meijer. His legacy will benefit all the communities in west Michigan.

Ms. Nancy Krupiarz, Executive Director, Michigan Trails and Greenways Alliance.

Ms. Nancy Krupiarz, Executive Director of the Michigan Trails and Greenways Alliance, advised the Board that she is in support of the name addition for the White Pine Trail. This is the type of thing that encourages private sector contributions, especially when it helps to leverage other funds. Given his numerous contributions for trails, she feels Mr. Meijer deserves to be recognized.

The trail needs to be developed for its tourism potential. A 92-mile developed trail will be a magnet that will draw people to it all over the country. If this trail name change happens, it may cultivate the way for future maintenance funds, as the donor has been known to put funds into an endowment for maintenance.

Ms. Krupiarz also expressed her support for 05-171, Pere Marquette Trail Extension, City of Clare. The connector to get from the Pere Marquette Trail to the City of Clare is very important. Clare will be a trail hub for the future, but the trail falls short at this time. By funding this project, it would also serve as a momentum for getting the trail over on the west side to continue on into Baldwin, where there is a state trail.

Mr. Richard Granse, Vice-Chair, Friends of the White Pine Trail (Southern Portion).

Mr. Richard Granse, Vice-Chair of the Friends of the White Pine Trail, stated that this is a long-term commitment by Mr. Meijer. Mr. Meijer wishes to conduct community funding north of Kent County along the White Pine Trail. He feels public-private partnerships are really important in these economic times. He reiterated that no state funding is being asked for this project.

Ms. Pollack asked if the Friends of the White Pine Trail group are asking the Board for action to be taken today. Mr. Heyboer responded the "Friends" would like to see some action taken so they could move forward. Ms. Pollack stated that it appears that there are many partners involved with this trail. She suggested the "White Pine (Donor's Name) State Trail." Mr. Heyboer responded that he felt the donor would be happy with that suggestion.

Chairperson Washington stated that this is a much larger issue than just this trail. There is a difference when a park is totally privately owned (such as Comerica Park) versus naming parks or other areas after private individuals that have public money involved. There may be citizens who would object to such a park or area being named after an individual. The question becomes what is the Board's policy on naming things that have public dollars involved. He does not feel the Board can get to that solution today.

Chairperson Washington suggested that a subcommittee be formed to discuss the Board's naming policy. The subcommittee's findings would be discussed at the February 22, 2006 meeting. Mr. Heyboer stated that if the Board needs time to discuss the policy that would be the right thing to do. This request is not a corporate name, but rather an individual's name. In today's financial situation, we have to look at things differently. State parks have been named for people in the past. We need to look at the conditions we are living under now and how can we do the best thing for the people of the State of Michigan.

Chairperson Washington asked Ms. Pollack and Mr. Torre to serve on the subcommittee to discuss the Board's naming policy (Board Policy 92.3). Mr. Garner will serve as an alternate.

At this point, Mr. Heyboer made some comments in support of 05-076, Cannon Township Non-Motorized Trail, submitted by Cannon Township. The township has passed a mileage to move forward on the trail and the community is very supportive. The township is ready to begin building it this year. This trail will connect with other trails in the county. He hopes the Board looks favorably towards funding this project.

Mr. Tom Woiwode, Director, GreenWays Initiative.

Mr. Tom Woiwode, Director of GreenWays Initiative, made a presentation in support of 05-153, Tricentennial State Park and Harbor, DNR. He informed the Board of recent developments in the park. In August, Ms. Mindy Koch, Resource Management Deputy for DNR, advised the Board that this was the highest priority development project for the DNR. At the September meeting, Mr. Woiwode advised the Board that the Community Foundation had awarded this project a \$587,000 matching grant which would match DNR and MDOT funds. Since that time there have been a couple of other funding opportunities that have developed. The federal Transportation Bill included in it \$3 million that will go to the Detroit East Riverfront project. In the most recent federal appropriations bill that has been passed, another \$8 million is coming to the East Riverfront.

Mr. Woiwode further stated that the Community Foundation and the MNRTF Board supported the development of the Dequindre Cut project, with construction to take place summer of 2006.

Mr. Ralph Richard, Director, Oakland County Parks.

Mr. Ralph Richard, Director of Oakland County Parks, stated that at the Board's evening meeting, the question was raised on the county's fee policy. If the Board has any questions, he would be happy to answer them. Ms. Pollack asked what the total amount of funding is and percentage of funding for the county's park system that fees are charged. Mr. Richard responded that \$500,000 is generated through the park system and operation was \$18.9 million. Most of that is raised by millage which has been passed six times by the residents of the county. The park system is 40 years old. If a resident does not have money to get into the park system, free passes can be arranged through social services agencies and churches. Ms. Pollack asked how many passes have been issued in the last year. Mr. Richard responded

approximately 230 in the past year. Most of these passes were issued to senior citizens. Ms. Pollack asked if there was an income qualification to get a free pass. Mr. Richard responded that it is the same qualification if someone were to receive food stamps.

Ms. Mindy Koch, Resource Management Deputy, DNR.

Ms. Mindy Koch, Resource Management Deputy of the DNR, wished to address a request that was made at the Board's evening meeting by The Nature Conservancy. This was in reference to asking for an additional \$3 million for the Kamehameha Schools Development Rights Purchase (05-133). Based on this request, she would like to recommend that the DNR lapse the \$3 million that they had been holding for over three years for the DNR's portion of the Denison property. The DNR is close to force lapsing it at this time, with about nine months left. The DNR does not envision within these nine months even beginning discussions with the property owners to purchase the property. This property has been in litigation for some time. Until the litigation has been resolved, the DNR is not able to have any serious discussions with the property owners regarding purchase.

Ms. Koch recommends that in full or in part the \$3 million could be lapsed and that these funds be exempted from the "smoothing fund." The \$3 million then could be made available for projects on the Board's recommended acquisition projects list for 2005.

Ms. Pollack asked if this was for a different Denison property than what was on the Board's list that was withdrawn. Ms. Koch responded the property was owned by the same owner. The DNR has been working in coordination with community and others. The DNR's portion of the Denison property is adjacent to the state park. The community's (City of Saugatuck) interest has been in the southern portion of the property. The property is split by a river or channel that goes through the property. The DNR has been working on acquiring the property for a long time. The DNR's portion of the property was designated for the northern portion. It is separate from what was withdrawn by the City of Saugatuck.

Ms. Pollack stated that she would like to hear from Ms. Julie Stoneman or Ms. Helen Taylor, who are working on these acquisitions. Her primary question is what happens if the negotiations are completed a year from now, will there be funding to get the property. Ms. Koch advised the Board that the DNR is still extremely interested in acquiring this property.

Chairperson Washington asked if the money is lapsed and is applied to a different project, would the money then have to be reappropriated or is the appropriation already in place. Ms. Koch responded that the money would have to be reappropriated because it was appropriated specifically for the Denison project.

Ms. Helen Taylor, Executive Director of The Land Conservancy, addressed the Board on the \$3.5 million that was withdrawn by the City of Saugatuck for their portion of the Denison property. The Land Conservancy of West Michigan, The Nature Conservancy and the City of Saugatuck have been working with the land owners for the south portion of the Denison property. There has been some progress made in the discussions within the last couple of months. It is hoped that an agreement will be secured by mid-2006 for the southern portion. The reason that these funds were withdrawn at this point is really in the spirit of good will to make the funds available for others. It is hoped that the Conservancies can help the DNR acquire the north side in the future.

Ms. Julie Stoneman, Executive Director of the Land Conservancy of West Michigan, also added that conservancies have been in active conversation with the land owners. The north and south portions of the property are on different tracks. She feels it makes sense for the DNR to relinquish the funds for their portion of the property at this time. She does not want anyone to think that this property is no longer viable, and it is hoped that the owners will resolve their issues.

**MOVED BY MR. GARNER, SUPPORTED BY MR. TORRE, TO LAPSE \$3 MILLION FOR THE DENISON PROPERTY ACQUISITION PROJECT AND EXEMPT THE ENTIRE \$3 MILLION FROM THE “SMOOTHING FUND” TO BE APPLIED TO THE 2005 MNRTF ACQUISITION PROJECTS FUNDING CYCLE. PASSED.**

Representative Tonya Schuitmaker.

Representative Tonya Schuitmaker made a presentation in support of 05-081, Deerlick Creek Park Acquisition, South Haven Township. Beachfront property is getting very scarce and for a limited time the developer is willing to sell the property. The property is 2.1 acres in size and has numerous wildlife and birds.

Representative Schuitmaker also expressed her support for 05-027, South Haven Area Recreational Park, City of South Haven and 05-172, LRD Sports Complex Acquisition, Lawrence Township.

Representative Schuitmaker asked the Board for their consideration in approving these projects.

Mr. Todd Vigland and Mr. Glen Chown, Grand Traverse Regional Land Conservancy – 05-168, Glacial Hills Pathway and Natural Area, Forest Home Township.

Mr. Todd Vigland and Mr. Glen Chown made a presentation in support of 05-168, Glacial Hills Pathway and Natural Area, Forest Home Township. The property is 345 acres and would be acquired for public open space and resource protection. It is just northwest of the Village of Bellaire in Forest Home Township. This acquisition is the number one priority identified in the township's parks and recreation plan.

Mr. Vigland also mentioned that this property is also a very historic area for hunting. The property has been under the CFA for a number of decades. There are all kinds of hills and valleys on the property, as well as many springs and streams.

Mr. Vigland pointed out that the local match will be approximately 50 percent towards the acquisition of the property, with the township contributing \$100,000. The county is also contributing \$100,000 and a bargain sale from the land owner.

Mr. Chown thanked the Board for their leadership in carrying out the roles of the 29-year old MNRTF. He also wished to point out the big cash match which shows the township's commitment to this project. He pointed out that this project was submitted in the secondary cycle for acquisition projects and has not received the staff review as is done with applications submitted for the April deadline. At the last meeting, Ms. Pollack asked if bird watching, hiking and hunting could all be done on the same property. The answer is yes, this is a large piece of property. In this era of the quest for public land, we need the conservation groups and environmental groups working together.



Ms. Pollack asked what would happen to the property if it was not acquired for a year. Mr. Chown responded that there is a two-year option on the property. The option began in July of 2005 and conceivably could be looked at next year for funding.

Mr. Mark Randolph, Executive Director, Grass River Natural Area.

Mr. Mark Randolph, Executive Director of the Grass River Natural Area, made a presentation in support of 05-024, Grass River Natural Area Addition, Antrim County. The Grass River project started in 1969 and was originally funded by the Kammer Land Trust (now MNRTF). At the present time it is 1165 acres in size. The project being requested provides access to deer, bear, turkey, bobcat, etc., as well as a 120-year old swamp. It was ranked high by Grants Management staff.

Ms. Suzie Fitzgibbon, SHARP Committee and Ms. Robin Abshire, Leisure Services Director, City of South Haven.

Ms. Suzie Fitzgibbon, member of the SHARP Committee and Ms. Robin Abshire, Leisure Services Director for the City of South Haven, made a presentation in support of 05-027, South Haven Area Recreational Park, City of South Haven. This project would provide recreational opportunities for children in the community with the development of ball fields, trails and other recreation activities. The children in the area are now playing on very small school fields. The economic impact would be increased approximately \$800,000, based on the tourist bureau's estimations. This project is close to the Black River and Kal-Haven Trail.

Ms. Robin Abshire, Leisure Services Director for the City of South Haven, reiterated Ms. Fitzgibbon's remarks. She urged the Board to consider this acquisition for funding.

Ms. Jeri Feltner, Village of DeTour Village.

Ms. Jeri Feltner from the Village of DeTour Village, made a presentation in support of 05-084, DeTour Waterfront Property Acquisition, Village of DeTour Village. Their state representative, Representative Gary McDowell, was in attendance at the meeting, but had to leave for another meeting. One of the points she wished to emphasize was the tremendous economic benefits that can be derived for the eastern Upper Peninsula by the Board's approval of this project. This project would include rare public access to the St. Mary's River, and is the only public access area that visitors could view the offshore historic DeTour reef light from an offshore site. This could provide economic benefits for visitors who go to the Whitefish Point light.

Ms. Feltner further stated that U.S. Senator Debbie Stabenow has promoted the Michigan Heritage Trail and that would be a big boost to that program in bringing additional tourists to this area.

Mr. Dennis Keiser, Supervisor, Bear Creek Township.

Mr. Dennis Keiser, Supervisor of Bear Creek Township, wished to thank the Board and staff for all their commitment for the applications that are being presented today. He also mentioned that their state representative, Representative Gary McDowell was in attendance, but had to leave for a committee meeting.

Mr. Guy Williams, G. O. Williams and Associates, LLC.

Mr. Guy Williams of G. O. Williams and Associations, LLC, made a presentation in support of 05-165, Village Wood Lake/Orchard Hills West Acquisition, City of Novi. This acquisition is in a very densely populated area. He wished to reiterate the comments made at the evening meeting. He underscored the uniqueness of the location and the demographics of the population who would be served by the project. People have been using this property, as it is somewhat in a subdivision area.

Chairperson Washington asked if, at the present time, this project could be completed because of some easement difficulties. Mr. James Wood, Manager, Grants Management, DNR, first outlined the staff's scoring of the project, as questions were raised at the evening meeting. Last night the Board asked what the project would score in light of the new match. The project would score 220. There are a couple of issues with the easements. Chairperson Washington asked if the Board were to fund the project, is it doable under the present circumstances. Mr. Wood responded that if the property that is being donated and appraised and the value is high enough, and considering the easements that are on the property, it is doable. He is concerned, however, when you place conservation easements on property, it affects the value. He does not know for sure that this could be high enough for the match.

Chairperson Washington stated that because of conservation easements that the value of the property, which is now part of the match, may not be high enough to meet the criteria for the match. Mr. Wood responded that is correct. Mr. Garner asked at that point in time, should the Board concur and go ahead with the project, and if the city meets that roadblock, that the money be returned to the MNRTF or the city would need to find other sources of income. Mr. Wood responded that is correct. Chairperson Washington asked if it would be considered a conversion if they were to find other sources of match. Mr. Wood responded no.

Mr. Andrew Mutch, President of Friends of Novi Parks, added that the city was aware of the issue. The city was not able to get a full appraisal on the property in question. There was an appraisal done on the first property. The city was not able to get a full appraisal on the second property. The appraiser who did the first property appraisal did do a comparison study on comparable properties that have been purchased by land conservancies with conservation easements on them. It was his opinion that the value of the appraisal for the property would be in excess of what the city submitted. He looked at eight or ten properties in the Oakland County area for comparison. Mr. Mutch believes that the second appraisal will show in excess of the amount the city has requested for the secure match.

Ms. Pollack asked what the match amount was. Mr. Mutch responded that the local match would be \$282,000--\$52,000 from the City of Novi and \$108,000 in-kind land donation for 36 acres. That was the property in question. This is around \$3,000 per acre. With the comparison and even with the conservation easement, it would be about \$4,500 per acre. The property is within the City of Novi where developable property goes for approximately \$100,000 an acre. The remaining \$121,000 of in-kind donation is on the 14.97 acres that has already been approved for development. Ms. Pollack asked if the appraisal came up short in value to make the match, what are the options the city could come up with to make the match. Mr. Mutch responded that the worse case scenario would be 0 and the city would be short \$108,000.

#### IV. OLD BUSINESS.

##### 2006 Meeting Schedule – LOCATIONS.

Mr. Wood advised the Board that locations for the 2006 MNRTF Board meetings have been confirmed. Three meetings will be held at a new location for the Board—Lansing Community College West Campus. This facility is easily accessible and offers exceptional audio-visual capabilities. The remaining two Lansing based meetings will be at the Clarion Hotel and Conference Center. The out-of-Lansing meeting will be in Brighton, with the location yet to be determined.

**MOVED BY MR. GARNER, SUPPORTED BY MR. TORRE, TO ADOPT THE MICHIGAN NATURAL RESOURCES TRUST FUND BOARD 2006 MEETING LOCATIONS. PASSED.**

##### Board Policy 94.1 – Use and Conversions of MNRTF Project Areas – FINAL ADOPTION.

Mr. Garner asked if discussion could be deferred to the February 22, 2006 Board meeting when the Board has more time to review the policy as it is an involved issue.

**MOVED BY MR. GARNER, SUPPORTED BY MR. TORRE, TO DEFER DISCUSSION OF BOARD POLICY 94.1, USE AND CONVERSIONS OF MNRTF PROJECT AREAS, TO THE FEBRUARY 22, 2006 MEETING. PASSED.**

##### 2005 MNRTF Acquisition and Development Applications – STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS AND BOARD APPROVAL.

Mr. Garner wished to make a motion moving \$400,000 from acquisition to development funding.

**MOVED BY MR. GARNER, SUPPORTED BY MS. POLLACK, TO MOVE \$400,000 FROM ACQUISITION TO DEVELOPMENT FUNDING. PASSED.**

The Board proceeded to discuss recommendations for development projects.

**MOVED BY MR. GARNER, SUPPORTED BY MS. POLLACK, TO ADOPT THE DEVELOPMENT LIST AS PRESENTED BY STAFF. PASSED.**

Mr. Wood advised the Board that the City of Fremont wished to reduce the request of their application (05-107) from \$192,650 to \$130,560, a difference of \$62,090.

**MOVED BY MR. GARNER, SUPPORTED BY MR. TORRE, TO MOVE AN ADDITIONAL \$60,000 FROM ACQUISITION TO DEVELOPMENT FUNDING. PASSED.**

**MOVED BY MR. GARNER, SUPPORTED BY MS. POLLACK, TO APPROVE THE DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS INDICATED ON THE LIST PROVIDED BY STAFF FROM 05-018, CITY OF ST. IGNACE, THROUGH AND INCLUDING 05-009, CITY OF SCOTTVILLE, AND TO ADD 05-153, DNR, TRICENTENNIAL STATE PARK AND HARBOR.**

**MOVED BY MS. POLLACK, SUPPORTED BY MR. TORRE, TO APPROVE THE FOLLOWING DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS:**

**05-018, CITY OF ST. IGNACE, HURON BOARDWALK - \$137,500**  
**05-021, CITY OF GLADSTONE, GLADSTONE 10<sup>TH</sup> STREET PIER - \$155,000**  
**05-052, CITY OF BELDING, SILK CITY NATURE TRAIL - \$166,400**  
**05-008, CITY OF SCOTTVILLE, RIVERSIDE PARK BOAT LAUNCH SITE IMPROVEMENTS - \$82,294**  
**05-014, CITY OF ALPENA, NORTH RIVERFRONT PARK HERITAGE IMPROVEMENTS - \$214,520**  
**05-106, ADA TOWNSHIP, ROSELLE PARK TRAIL IMPROVEMENTS - \$122,210**  
**05-109, CITY OF MANISTIQUE, MANISTIQUE CENTRAL PARK IMPROVEMENTS - \$424,000**  
**05-128, IRON COUNTY, PENTOGA PARK CAMPGROUND IMPROVEMENTS - \$90,000**  
**05-001, ALLEGAN COUNTY, NEW RICHMOND BRIDGE PARK DEVELOPMENT - \$382,784**  
**05-151, DNR, STATE PARK CAMPER CABINS - \$375,600**  
**05-122, CITY OF CASPIAN, FISHING QUARRY PARK DEVELOPMENT - \$48,800**  
**05-077, CITY OF IRON RIVER, APPLE BLOSSOM TRAIL RIVER WALKWAY - \$86,700**  
**05-118, ALMIRA TOWNSHIP, RANSON LAKE NATURAL AREA - \$81,400**  
**05-074, MIDLAND COUNTY, SANFORD LAKE PARK IMPROVEMENTS - \$444,000**  
**05-107, CITY OF FREMONT, FREMONT TOWN AND COUNTRY PATH - \$130,560**  
**05-071, CITY OF LANSING, LANSING RIVER TRAIL SOUTH EXTENSION - \$426,500**  
**05-086, CITY OF WHITEHALL, GOODRICH PARK RENOVATIONS - \$90,500**  
**05-117, JACKSON COUNTY, FALLING WATERS TRAIL PROJECT - \$500,000**  
**05-143, DNR, CAMPGROUND ACCESS IMPROVEMENTS - \$500,000**  
**05-033, EATON COUNTY, FOX MEMORIAL PARK IMPROVEMENTS - \$297,998**  
**05-124, VILLAGE OF EMPIRE, LAKE MICHIGAN BEACH PARK IMPROVEMENTS - \$356,600**  
**05-054, CITY OF YPSILANTI, RIVERSIDE PARK CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PROJECT - \$80,290**  
**05-104, CITY OF TRAVERSE CITY, BOARDMAN LAKE TRAIL WEST - \$500,000**  
**05-026, CITY OF KENTWOOD, KENNETH STANABACK PARK - \$99,330**  
**05-068, CITY OF BEAVERTON, BEAVERTON FISHING PIERS - \$59,000**  
**05-072, CITY OF DETROIT, BUTZEL PLAYFIELD IMPROVEMENTS - \$500,000**  
**05-076, CANNON TOWNSHIP, CANNON TOWNSHIP NON-MOTORIZED TRAIL - \$500,000**  
**05-111, MACKINAC ISLAND STATE PARK COMMISSION, OLD MACKINAC POINT LIGHT STATION IMPROVEMENTS - \$189,000**  
**05-009, CITY OF SCOTTVILLE, RIVERSIDE PARK CAMPGROUND REDEVELOPMENT - \$284,332**  
**05-153, DNR, TRICENTENNIAL STATE PARK AND HARBOR - \$500,000**

**PASSED.**

The Board proceeded to discuss recommendations for acquisition projects.

**MOVED BY MS. POLLACK, SUPPORTED BY MR. GARNER, TO ADOPT THE ACQUISITION LIST AS PRESENTED BY STAFF. PASSED.**

**MOVED BY MR. GARNER, SUPPORTED BY MR. TORRE, TO APPROVE THE FOLLOWING SMALL ACQUISITION GRANT INITIATIVE PROJECTS:**

**05-171, CITY OF CLARE - \$99,100  
05-097, WATERFORD TOWNSHIP - \$87,000  
05-010, CITY OF ST. CHARLES - \$45,667**

**PASSED.**

**MOVED BY MS. POLLACK, SUPPORTED BY MR. GARNER, TO APPROVE THE ACQUISITION PROJECTS INDICATED ON THE LIST PROVIDED BY STAFF FROM 05-132, DNR, THROUGH AND INCLUDING 05-055, KENT COUNTY, WITH THE FOLLOWING DELETIONS:**

**05-170, CITY OF SAUGATUCK - \$3,560,000  
05-134, DNR - \$750,000**

**AND ADDING THE FOLLOWING:**

**05-063, BEAR CREEK TOWNSHIP - \$2,018,325  
05-165, CITY OF NOVI - \$846,338  
05-147, DNR - \$330,000  
05-047, CITY OF WAYLAND - \$130,000  
05-024, ANTRIM COUNTY - \$50,000**

**PASSED.**

**THE FOLLOWING ACQUISITION PROJECTS WERE APPROVED:**

**05-132, DNR, CMS ARCADIA/GREEN POINT DUNES CONSERVATION EASEMENT  
- \$2,675,000  
05-141, DNR, LEE GRANDE RANCH CONSERVATION EASEMENT - \$2,750,000  
05-078, KEWEENAW COUNTY, GRATIOT RIVER COUNTY PARK ADDITION  
- \$1,957,500  
05-156, DNR, RUSSELL LAKE WINTER DEER HABITAT ACQUISITION - \$1,820,000  
05-133, DNR, KAMEHAMEHA SCHOOLS DEVELOPMENT RIGHTS PURCHASE –  
\$5,000,000 (increased from \$3,000,000)  
05-140, DNR, FLOWING WELL CONSERVATION EASEMENT - \$3,500,000  
05-154, DNR, WILDLIFE AREA CONSOLIDATION LUMP SUM - \$1,250,000 (reduced  
from \$2,000,000)  
05-102, OAKLAND TOWNSHIP, STONY CREEK CORRIDOR PARK ACQUISITION –  
\$893,700  
05-142, DNR, BEAR RIVER PARCEL CONSERVATION EASEMENT - \$280,000**

**05-119, CALUMET TOWNSHIP, SWEDETOWN RECREATION AREA ACQUISITION – \$105,200**  
**05-155, DNR, WINTER DEER HABITAT INITIATIVE - \$1,350,000 (reduced from \$2,000,000)**  
**05-136, DNR, STATE TRAILWAYS INITIATIVE - \$1,900,000 (reduced from \$2,000,000)**  
**05-032, OAKLAND COUNTY, HIGHLAND TOWNSHIP PROPERTY ACQUISITION – \$1,440,000**  
**05-055, KENT COUNTY, CHIEF HAZY CLOUD PARK ACQUISITION - \$962,000**  
**05-171, CITY OF CLARE, PERE MARQUETTE TRAIL EXTENSION - \$99,100 – (SAGI PROJECT)**  
**05-097, WATERFORD TOWNSHIP, ELIZABETH LAKE WOODS PARK EXPANSION - \$87,000 (SAGI PROJECT)**  
**05-010, VILLAGE OF ST. CHARLES, ST. CHARLES AREA PARK LAND ACQUISITION - \$45,700 (SAGI PROJECT)**  
**05-063, BEAR CREEK TOWNSHIP, WALLOON LAKE ACCESS - \$2,018,400**  
**05-165, CITY OF NOVI, VILLAGE WOOD LAKE/ORCHARD HILLS WEST ACQUISITION - \$846,400**  
**05-147, DNR, LIGHTHOUSE WEST PROPERTY CONSERVATION EASEMENT – \$330,000 (reduced from \$632,524)**  
**05-047, CITY OF WAYLAND, WAYLAND RABBIT RIVER RECREATION PROJECT - \$130,000**  
**05-024, ANTRIM COUNTY, GRASS RIVER NATURAL AREA ADDITION - \$50,000 (reduced from \$132,700)**

Mr. Wood asked with the \$5,000,000 being awarded to 05-133, DNR, Kamehameha Schools Development Rights Purchase, does that mean next year they will receive \$1,000,000. Chairperson Washington responded yes.

#### V. NEW BUSINESS.

##### Access Criteria.

Chairperson Washington stated that the Grants Management staff put together a draft for a new Board Special Initiative for unique opportunities for access. This would increase the amount of points critical access is awarded when projects are scored. This would relate to inland lakes, streams, waterways and things of this nature that currently do not have adequate or no access.

Mr. Wood added that this would be Board Special Initiative #6 and would be used in the 2006 selection process. This Special Initiative would apply 100 points to any application that provided a new or significantly increased access opportunity to an inland lake, river, or Great Lake and connecting water. Factors would include:

- There is no current access available to the resource, or the access opportunities are inadequate.
- Providing access to the resource is the primary purpose of the project.
- The resource provides for a high-quality recreation opportunity and this is supported by DNR staff.
- Resource is capable of supporting public recreation opportunities.

- Fees for using facilities at the site will be appropriate and customary for the expected users.

Ms. Pollack stated that she feels this is an important issue to the criteria; however, she would like to have the subcommittee review the fee issue. She feels the term “customary” is too little support from the public and too much support from the individuals without adequate consideration for those who do not have money. She would like the Board to come up with some policies that are appropriate. She would like this deferred to the February 22, 2006 Board meeting.

Mr. Wood stated that the 2006 selection criteria will need to be published in this month.

Ms. Pollack suggested that the fee reference in the policy be stricken in its entirety. Mr. Garner stated that there might be times when a small fee really helps with maintenance of the site. He does not want to rush approving this initiative, as there might be ways to make access better if there is a small fee on some projects.

Chairperson Washington advised Mr. Wood that if the 2006 selection criteria needs to be printed before the February 22, 2006 Board meeting, publish the current criteria, and if it comes to a point where there is a special issue, we can take that into consideration at that time.

**MOVED BY MS. POLLACK, SUPPORTED BY MR. GARNER, THAT THE PROPOSED BOARD SPECIAL INITIATIVE #6 REGARDING ACCESS OPPORTUNITIES BE PURSUED FURTHER BY THE BOARD’S SUBCOMMITTEE CONSISTING OF MS. POLLACK AND MR. TORRE, WITH MR. GARNER AS AN ALTERNATE. PASSED.**

TF03-119, Saginaw Valley Rail Trail (Development), TF94-213, Saginaw Valley Rail Trail (Acquisition), Saginaw County – **PROJECT CONVERSION.**

Mr. Wood outlined the project conversion request for the Board. The county has been involved in negotiating a dispute over a 50 x 900 linear foot segment of the trail parallel to a private landscaping business (Tri-Valley Landscaping). Tri-Valley is claiming rightful ownership of the property through adverse possession and has been using the property for 15 years. Saginaw County wishes to convert this segment of the trail to Tri-Valley. Recreational use on the remaining right-of-way will not be impacted by the transfer and the trail has been re-routed to the north.

The county was not able to identify a suitable parcel of land which provided equivalent recreational value to mitigate this transfer; therefore, they are proposing to mitigate the loss of this property by developing a pre-fabricated vault toilet facility at the southern trailhead in the Village of St. Charles. Staff has reviewed this proposal and it has received a lot of public consideration. This seems to be a very equitable way to resolve the issue.

Staff recommends that the Board approve the project conversion.

**MOVED BY MR. GARNER, SUPPORTED BY MR. TORRE, TO APPROVE THE PROJECT CONVERSION FOR TF03-119, SAGINAW VALLEY RAIL TRAIL (DEVELOPMENT) AND TF94-213, SAGINAW VALLEY RAIL TRAIL (ACQUISITION), SAGINAW COUNTY TO CONVERT A 50 X 900 LINEAR FOOT SEGMENT OF THE SAGINAW VALLEY RAIL TRAIL TO TRI-VALLEY LANDSCAPING, AND ACCEPT MITIGATION IN THE FORM OF DEVELOPMENT OF A VAULT TOILET FACILITY AT THE SOUTHERN TRAILHEAD WITH THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS:**

- **THE VAULT TOILET WILL BE CONSTRUCTED NO LATER THAN DECEMBER 31, 2006.**

**PASSED.**

Election of Chairperson for 2006.

**MOVED BY MS. POLLACK, SUPPORTED BY MR. TORRE, THAT MR. WASHINGTON BE APPOINTED AS CHAIRPERSON OF THE MNRTF BOARD FOR 2006. PASSED.**

**MOVED BY MR. GARNER, SUPPORTED BY MR. TORRE, TO APPOINT MS. POLLACK AS VICE-CHAIRPERSON. PASSED.**

VI. STATUS REPORTS.

DNR Real Estate Report.

Mr. Wood outlined the DNR real estate report for the Board's information. There was no discussion.

Local Projects Completion Report.

The Board had previously been provided this report. There was no discussion.

Financial Report.

The Board had previously been provided this report. There was no discussion.

Lump Sum Report.

The Board had previously been provided this report. There was no discussion.

VII. OTHER MATTERS AS ARE PROPERLY BROUGHT BEFORE THE BOARD.

None.



VIII. ANNOUNCEMENTS.

The next meeting of the Michigan Natural Resources Trust Fund Board is scheduled for 9:00 AM, Wednesday, February 22, 2006, Lansing Community College (LCC) West Campus, Auditorium, 5708 Cornerstone, Lansing, Michigan.

IX. ADJOURNMENT.

**MOVED BY MR. GARNER, SUPPORTED BY MR. TORRE, TO ADJOURN  
THE MEETING. PASSED.**

The meeting was adjourned at 11:30 AM.

---

Sam Washington, Chairperson  
Michigan Natural Resources Trust Fund  
Board of Trustees

---

James Wood, Manager  
Grants Management

---

DATE